**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
**FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY**

————————————————

                                    CIVIL ACTION NUMBER:

IN RE:  VALSARTAN PRODUCTS
LIABILITY LITIGATION            19-md-02875

————————————————    CASE MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE

      Mitchell H. Cohen Building & U.S. Courthouse
      4th & Cooper Streets
      Camden, New Jersey  08101
      March 29, 2023
      Commencing at 1:06 p.m.

B E F O R E:                THE HONORABLE ROBERT B. KUGLER
                            UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

A P P E A R A N C E S:


      MAZIE SLATER KATZ & FREEMAN, LLC
      BY:  ADAM M. SLATER, ESQUIRE
      103 Eisenhower Parkway
      Roseland, New Jersey  07068
      For the Plaintiffs


      HONIK LLC
      BY:  RUBEN HONIK, ESQUIRE
      1515 Market Street, Suite 1100
      Philadelphia, Pennsylvania  191032
      For the Plaintiffs


      KANNER & WHITELEY, LLC
      BY:  CONLEE S. WHITELEY, ESQUIRE
      701 Camp Street
      New Orleans, Louisiana  70130
      For the Plaintiffs

*United States District Court*

1  **A P P E A R A N C E S (Continued):**

2        LEVIN PAPANTONIO THOMAS MITCHELL RAFFERTY PROCTOR, P.A.
         BY:  DANIEL A. NIGH, ESQUIRE
3        316 S. Baylen, Suite 600
         Pensacola, Florida 32502
4        For the Plaintiffs

5
         KIRTLAND & PACKARD LLP
6        BY:  BEHRAM V. PAREKH, ESQUIRE
         1638 South Pacific Coast Highway
7        Redondo Beach, California  90277
         For the Plaintiffs

8

9        SKADDEN, ARPS, SLATE, MEAGHER & FLOM LLP
         BY:  JESSICA DAVIDSON, ESQUIRE
10       1440 New York Avenue, N.W.
         Washington, DC 20005
11       For the Defendants, Prinston Pharmaceuticals,
         Solco Healthcare U.S. LLC, and  Zhejiang Huahai
12       Pharmaceuticals Ltd.

13
         GREENBERG TRAURIG LLP
14       BY:  VICTORIA DAVIS LOCKARD, ESQUIRE
         3333 Piedmont Road, NE, Suite 2500
15       Atlanta, Georgia  30305

16       - and-

17       BY:  GREGORY E. OSTFELD,  ESQUIRE
         77 West Wacker Drive, Suite 3100
18       Chicago, Illinois 60601
         For the Defendants, Teva Pharmaceutical Industries Ltd.,
19       Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc., Actavis LLC,
         and Actavis Pharma, Inc.

20

21
     **ALSO  PRESENT:**
22
         LORETTA SMITH, ESQUIRE
23       Judicial Law Clerk to The Honorable Robert B. Kugler

24       Larry MacStravic, Courtroom Deputy

25


*United States District Court*

```
 1              (PROCEEDINGS held in open court before The Honorable

 2   ROBERT B. KUGLER at 1:06 p.m.)

 3              THE COURT:  Thanks everybody, have a seat.  Welcome

 4   back.

 5              You're all thrilled to be in Camden in the spring.

 6   Right?  Sort of?  Maybe?

 7              All right.

 8              Ms. Mitchell, do we need the lawyers to identify

 9   themselves before they speak, or do you have a good grasp on

10   who's who?

11              COURT REPORTER:  Anybody who is up at the front I

12   know, with the exception of this gentleman here.

13              Who are you?

14              MR. NIGH:  Daniel Nigh for the plaintiffs.

15              COURT REPORTER:  I am good.  Thank you, Your Honor.

16              THE COURT:  Good.  Well, if you have a problem, give

17   us a heads up.

18              COURT REPORTER:  I will.  Thank you.

19              THE COURT:  A couple things we need to discuss today.

20   I want to discuss first the March 23rd letter from

21   Ms. Davidson at Skadden about extending the deadlines.

22              I understand the plaintiffs have no objection.

23   Correct?

24              MR. SLATER:  We agree, Your Honor.

25              THE COURT:  We'll enter that order.  That takes care
```

*United States District Court*

 1 | of that.

 2 | Then we have the agenda items about the orders to

 3 | show cause.  And apparently only the fourth one, Czajkowski

 4 | I'm going to pronounce it, C-Z-A-J-K-O-W-S-K-I, is the only

 5 | one that survives, because you want to list that at the next

 6 | conference.

 7 | Barbara Knudson, K-N-U-D-S-D-O-N, and Balay,

 8 | B-A-L-A-Y, the orders to show cause will be dismissed.

 9 | Correct?

10 | MS. LOCKARD:  Correct, Your Honor.

11 | This is Victoria Lockard, for the record.

12 | THE COURT:  You have four you wish to list for orders

13 | to show cause.

14 | Any updates on those?

15 | MS. LOCKARD:  The only update we have is on the

16 | Andreotti case, Your Honor.  It has been cured and can be

17 | removed.

18 | The other three, Calhoun, Lalonde, and Trautman,

19 | we're asking to have relisted and returnable at the next CMC

20 | in those three matters.

21 | THE COURT:  Anybody here for the estate of Juanita

22 | Calhoun?

23 | (No response.)

24 | THE COURT:  Anybody here wants to be heard on the

25 | matter of Nancy Lalonde, L-A-L-O-N-D-E?

1          MR. PAREKH:  Your Honor, Behram Parekh.

2          This is not my plaintiff, but we've been contacted by

3   the attorney for Ms. Lalonde, and he says he's working with

4   defendants to cure.  He just wanted us to report that.

5          THE COURT:  Okay.  Well, you know, we'll list it for

6   an order to show cause, and obviously we can dismiss it,

7   dismiss the order to show cause if it gets worked out before

8   then.  Okay?

9          MR. PAREKH:  Thank you, Your Honor.

10          THE COURT:  And last Yvonne Trautman,

11   T-R-A-U-T-M-A-N.

12          Anybody want to be heard on that matter?

13          (No response.)

14          THE COURT:  All right.  Those three matters will be

15   listed for an order to show cause returnable at the next

16   conference.

17          And then we have 12 new ones that you want to list a

18   second time.

19          Any updates on any of those?

20          MS. LOCKARD:  That's correct, Your Honor.  No updates

21   on those.  And we request that the 12 listed on the letter be

22   moved forward to the next status conference.

23          THE COURT:  All right.  Estate of Joseph Kreseski,

24   anybody here on that?

25          (No response.)

*United States District Court*

```
 1              THE COURT:  Deborah Bixler, anybody here on that?

 2              (No response.)

 3              THE COURT:  Estate of Arlene Cohen, anybody here on

 4    that?

 5              (No response.)

 6              THE COURT:  Mark Emamder, E-M-A-M-D-E-R, anybody here

 7    on that?

 8              (No response.)

 9              THE COURT:  Diane Hardwick, anybody want to be heard

10    on that?

11              (No response.)

12              THE COURT:  Estate of Hamid Ahmadi, A-H-M-A-D-I,

13    anybody want to be heard on that?

14              (No response.)

15              THE COURT:  Michael Goss, G-O-S-S, anybody want to be

16    heard on that?

17              (No response.)

18              THE COURT:  Estate of Steven Jiles, J-I-L-E-S,

19    anybody want to be heard on that?

20              (No response.)

21              THE COURT:  Thomas Twardowsky, anybody want to be

22    heard on that?

23              (No response.)

24              THE COURT:  Donald Seifert, S-E-I-F-E-R-T, anybody

25    want to be heard on that?
```

```
 1              (No response.)

 2              THE COURT:  Rafael Feria, F-E-R-I-A, anybody want to

 3   be heard on that?

 4              (No response.)

 5              THE COURT:  And Mina Cole, C-O-L-E, anybody want to

 6   be heard on that?

 7              (No response.)

 8              THE COURT:  All right.  We will relist them for

 9   second listing at the next conference.

10              MS. LOCKARD:  Thank you, Judge.

11              (Proceedings concluded at 1:11 p.m.)

12                             -  -  -

13              I certify that the foregoing is a correct transcript

14   from the record of proceedings in the above-entitled matter.

15

16   /S/ Ann Marie Mitchell        30th day of March, 2023

17   Court Reporter/Transcriber    Date

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25
```

*United States District Court*

## /

*/S* [1] - 7:16

## 0

*07068* [1] - 1:14
*08101* [1] - 1:7

## 1

*103* [1] - 1:13
*1100* [1] - 1:17
*12* [2] - 5:17, 5:21
*1440* [1] - 2:10
*1515* [1] - 1:17
*1638* [1] - 2:6
*19-md-02875* [1] - 1:4
*191032* [1] - 1:17
*1:06* [2] - 1:8, 3:2
*1:11* [1] - 7:11

## 2

*20005* [1] - 2:10
*2023* [2] - 1:8, 7:16
*23rd* [1] - 3:20
*2500* [1] - 2:14
*29* [1] - 1:8

## 3

*30305* [1] - 2:15
*30th* [1] - 7:16
*3100* [1] - 2:17
*316* [1] - 2:3
*32502* [1] - 2:3
*3333* [1] - 2:14

## 4

*4th* [1] - 1:7

## 5

*576-7018* [1] - 1:23

## 6

*600* [1] - 2:3
*60601* [1] - 2:18

## 7

*701* [1] - 1:20
*70130* [1] - 1:21
*77* [1] - 2:17

## 8

*856* [1] - 1:23

## 9

*90277* [1] - 2:7

## A

*above-entitled* [1] - 7:14
*Actavis* [2] - 2:19, 2:19
*ACTION* [1] - 1:3
*ADAM* [1] - 1:13
*agenda* [1] - 4:2
*agree* [1] - 3:24
*Ahmadi* [1] - 6:12
*AHMADI* [1] - 6:12
*aided* [1] - 1:25
*ALSO* [1] - 2:21
*Andreotti* [1] - 4:16
*Ann* [1] - 7:16
*ann* [1] - 1:22
*AnnMarie_Mitchell@
    njd.uscourts.gov* [1]
    - 1:23
*Arlene* [1] - 6:3
*ARPS* [1] - 2:9
*Atlanta* [1] - 2:15
*attorney* [1] - 5:3
*Avenue* [1] - 2:10

## B

*Balay* [1] - 4:7
*BALAY* [1] - 4:8
*Barbara* [1] - 4:7
*Baylen* [1] - 2:3
*Beach* [1] - 2:7
*Behram* [1] - 5:1
*BEHRAM* [1] - 2:6
*Bixler* [1] - 6:1
*Building* [1] - 1:6

## C

*Calhoun* [2] - 4:18, 4:22
*California* [1] - 2:7
*Camden* [2] - 1:7, 3:5
*Camp* [1] - 1:20
*care* [1] - 3:25
*case* [1] - 4:16
*CASE* [1] - 1:5
*certify* [1] - 7:13
*Chicago* [1] - 2:18
*CIVIL* [1] - 1:3
*Clerk* [1] - 2:23
*CMC* [1] - 4:19
*Coast* [1] - 2:6
*Cohen* [2] - 1:6, 6:3
*Cole* [1] - 7:5
*COLE* [1] - 7:5
*Commencing* [1] - 1:8
*computer* [1] - 1:25
*computer-aided* [1] -
    1:25

## concluded

*concluded* [1] - 7:11
*CONFERENCE* [1] -
    1:5
*conference* [4] - 4:6,
    5:16, 5:22, 7:9
*CONLEE* [1] - 1:20
*contacted* [1] - 5:2
*Continued* [1] - 2:1
*Cooper* [1] - 1:7
*correct* [5] - 3:23, 4:9,
    4:10, 5:20, 7:13
*couple* [1] - 3:19
*COURT* [4] - 1:1, 3:11,
    3:15, 3:18
*court* [1] - 3:1
*Court* [2] - 1:22, 7:17
*Courthouse* [1] - 1:6
*Courtroom* [1] - 2:24
*cure* [1] - 5:4
*cured* [1] - 4:16
*Czajkowski* [1] - 4:3
*CZAJKOWSKI* [1] -
    4:4

## D

*DANIEL* [1] - 2:2
*Daniel* [1] - 3:14
*Date* [1] - 7:17
*Davidson* [1] - 3:21
*DAVIDSON* [1] - 2:9
*DAVIS* [1] - 2:14
*DC* [1] - 2:10
*deadlines* [1] - 3:21
*Deborah* [1] - 6:1
*Defendants* [2] - 2:11,
    2:18
*defendants* [1] - 5:4
*Deputy* [1] - 2:24
*Diane* [1] - 6:9
*discuss* [2] - 3:19,
    3:20
*dismiss* [2] - 5:6, 5:7
*dismissed* [1] - 4:8
*DISTRICT* [3] - 1:1,
    1:1, 1:10
*Donald* [1] - 6:24
*Drive* [1] - 2:17

## E

*Eisenhower* [1] - 1:13
*Emamder* [1] - 6:6
*EMAMDER* [1] - 6:6
*enter* [1] - 3:25
*entitled* [1] - 7:14
*ESQUIRE* [9] - 1:13,
    1:16, 1:20, 2:2, 2:6,
    2:9, 2:14, 2:17, 2:22
*estate* [5] - 4:21, 5:23,
    6:3, 6:12, 6:18

## exception

*exception* [1] - 3:12
*extending* [1] - 3:21

## F

*Feria* [1] - 7:2
*FERIA* [1] - 7:2
*first* [1] - 3:20
*FLOM* [1] - 2:9
*Florida* [1] - 2:3
*foregoing* [1] - 7:13
*forward* [1] - 5:22
*four* [1] - 4:12
*fourth* [1] - 4:3
*FREEMAN* [1] - 1:12
*front* [1] - 3:11

## G

*gentleman* [1] - 3:12
*Georgia* [1] - 2:15
*Goss* [1] - 6:15
*GOSS* [1] - 6:15
*grasp* [1] - 3:9
*GREENBERG* [1] -
    2:13
*GREGORY* [1] - 2:17

## H

*Hamid* [1] - 6:12
*Hardwick* [1] - 6:9
*heads* [1] - 3:17
*Healthcare* [1] - 2:11
*heard* [10] - 4:24, 5:12,
    6:9, 6:13, 6:16, 6:19,
    6:22, 6:25, 7:3, 7:6
*held* [1] - 3:1
*Highway* [1] - 2:6
*HONIK* [2] - 1:16, 1:16
*Honor* [7] - 3:15, 3:24,
    4:10, 4:16, 5:1, 5:9,
    5:20
*HONORABLE* [1] - 1:9
*Honorable* [2] - 2:23,
    3:1
*Huahai* [1] - 2:11

## I

*identify* [1] - 3:8
*Illinois* [1] - 2:18
*Inc* [2] - 2:19, 2:19
*Industries* [1] - 2:18
*items* [1] - 4:2

## J

*JERSEY* [1] - 1:1
*Jersey* [2] - 1:7, 1:14
*JESSICA* [1] - 2:9
*Jiles* [1] - 6:18

## JILES

*JILES* [1] - 6:18
*Joseph* [1] - 5:23
*Juanita* [1] - 4:21
*Judge* [1] - 7:10
*JUDGE* [1] - 1:10
*Judicial* [1] - 2:23

## K

*KANNER* [1] - 1:19
*KATZ* [1] - 1:12
*KIRTLAND* [1] - 2:5
*KNUDSDON* [1] - 4:7
*Knudson* [1] - 4:7
*Kreseski* [1] - 5:23
*KUGLER* [2] - 1:9, 3:2
*Kugler* [1] - 2:23

## L

*Lalonde* [3] - 4:18,
    4:25, 5:3
*LALONDE* [1] - 4:25
*larry* [1] - 2:24
*last* [1] - 5:10
*Law* [1] - 2:23
*lawyers* [1] - 3:8
*letter* [2] - 3:20, 5:21
*LEVIN* [1] - 2:2
*LIABILITY* [1] - 1:4
*list* [4] - 4:5, 4:12, 5:5,
    5:17
*listed* [2] - 5:15, 5:21
*listing* [1] - 7:9
*LITIGATION* [1] - 1:4
*LLC* [5] - 1:12, 1:16,
    1:19, 2:11, 2:19
*LLP* [3] - 2:5, 2:9, 2:13
*Lockard* [1] - 4:11
*LOCKARD* [5] - 2:14,
    4:10, 4:15, 5:20,
    7:10
*LORETTA* [1] - 2:22
*Louisiana* [1] - 1:21
*Ltd* [2] - 2:12, 2:18

## M

*MacStravic* [1] - 2:24
*MANAGEMENT* [1] -
    1:5
*March* [3] - 1:8, 3:20,
    7:16
*Marie* [2] - 1:22, 7:16
*Mark* [1] - 6:6
*Market* [1] - 1:17
*matter* [3] - 4:25, 5:12,
    7:14
*matters* [2] - 4:20,
    5:14
*MAZIE* [1] - 1:12

**MEAGHER** [1] - 2:9
**mechanical** [1] - 1:24
**Michael** [1] - 6:15
**Mina** [1] - 7:5
**MITCHELL** [1] - 2:2
**Mitchell** [4] - 1:6, 1:22, 3:8, 7:16
**moved** [1] - 5:22
**MR** [4] - 3:14, 3:24, 5:1, 5:9
**MS** [4] - 4:10, 4:15, 5:20, 7:10

## N

**N.W** [1] - 2:10
**Nancy** [1] - 4:25
**NE** [1] - 2:14
**need** [2] - 3:8, 3:19
**new** [1] - 5:17
**NEW** [1] - 1:1
**New** [4] - 1:7, 1:14, 1:21, 2:10
**next** [5] - 4:5, 4:19, 5:15, 5:22, 7:9
**NIGH** [2] - 2:2, 3:14
**Nigh** [1] - 3:14
**NUMBER** [1] - 1:3

## O

**objection** [1] - 3:22
**obviously** [1] - 5:6
**Official** [1] - 1:22
**one** [2] - 4:3, 4:5
**ones** [1] - 5:17
**open** [1] - 3:1
**order** [4] - 3:25, 5:6, 5:7, 5:15
**orders** [3] - 4:2, 4:8, 4:12
**Orleans** [1] - 1:21
**OSTFELD** [1] - 2:17

## P

**P.A** [1] - 2:2
**p.m** [3] - 1:8, 3:2, 7:11
**Pacific** [1] - 2:6
**PACKARD** [1] - 2:5
**PAPANTONIO** [1] - 2:2
**Parekh** [1] - 5:1
**PAREKH** [3] - 2:6, 5:1, 5:9
**Parkway** [1] - 1:13
**Pennsylvania** [1] - 1:17
**Pensacola** [1] - 2:3
**Pharma** [1] - 2:19
**Pharmaceutical** [1] -

2:18
**Pharmaceuticals** [3] - 2:11, 2:12, 2:19
**Philadelphia** [1] - 1:17
**Piedmont** [1] - 2:14
**plaintiff** [1] - 5:2
**Plaintiffs** [5] - 1:14, 1:18, 1:21, 2:4, 2:7
**plaintiffs** [2] - 3:14, 3:22
**PRESENT** [1] - 2:21
**Prinston** [1] - 2:11
**problem** [1] - 3:16
**proceedings** [1] - 7:14
**PROCEEDINGS** [1] - 3:1
**Proceedings** [2] - 1:24, 7:11
**PROCTOR** [1] - 2:2
**produced** [1] - 1:25
**PRODUCTS** [1] - 1:4
**pronounce** [1] - 4:4

## R

**Rafael** [1] - 7:2
**RAFFERTY** [1] - 2:2
**RE** [1] - 1:4
**record** [2] - 4:11, 7:14
**recorded** [1] - 1:24
**Redondo** [1] - 2:7
**relist** [1] - 7:8
**relisted** [1] - 4:19
**removed** [1] - 4:17
**report** [1] - 5:4
**REPORTER** [3] - 3:11, 3:15, 3:18
**Reporter** [1] - 1:22
**Reporter/
  Transcriber** [1] - 7:17
**request** [1] - 5:21
**response** [14] - 4:23, 5:13, 5:25, 6:2, 6:5, 6:8, 6:11, 6:14, 6:17, 6:20, 6:23, 7:1, 7:4, 7:7
**returnable** [2] - 4:19, 5:15
**Road** [1] - 2:14
**ROBERT** [2] - 1:9, 3:2
**Robert** [1] - 2:23
**Roseland** [1] - 1:14
**RUBEN** [1] - 1:16

## S

**seat** [1] - 3:3
**second** [2] - 5:18, 7:9
**SEIFERT** [1] - 6:24
**Seifert** [1] - 6:24

**show** [6] - 4:3, 4:8, 4:13, 5:6, 5:7, 5:15
**SKADDEN** [1] - 2:9
**Skadden** [1] - 3:21
**SLATE** [1] - 2:9
**SLATER** [3] - 1:12, 1:13, 3:24
**SMITH** [1] - 2:22
**Solco** [1] - 2:11
**sort** [1] - 3:6
**South** [1] - 2:6
**spring** [1] - 3:5
**STATES** [2] - 1:1, 1:10
**status** [1] - 5:22
**stenography** [1] - 1:24
**Steven** [1] - 6:18
**Street** [2] - 1:17, 1:20
**Streets** [1] - 1:7
**Suite** [4] - 1:17, 2:3, 2:14, 2:17
**survives** [1] - 4:5

## T

**T-R-A-U-T-M-A-N** [1] - 5:11
**Teva** [2] - 2:18, 2:19
**THE COURT** [23] - 3:3, 3:16, 3:19, 3:25, 4:12, 4:21, 4:24, 5:5, 5:10, 5:14, 5:23, 6:1, 6:3, 6:6, 6:9, 6:12, 6:15, 6:18, 6:21, 6:24, 7:2, 7:5, 7:8
**themselves** [1] - 3:9
**THOMAS** [1] - 2:2
**Thomas** [1] - 6:21
**three** [3] - 4:18, 4:20, 5:14
**thrilled** [1] - 3:5
**today** [1] - 3:19
**transcript** [2] - 1:24, 7:13
**transcription** [1] - 1:25
**TRAURIG** [1] - 2:13
**Trautman** [2] - 4:18, 5:10
**Twardowsky** [1] - 6:21

## U

**U.S** [2] - 1:6, 2:11
**UNITED** [2] - 1:1, 1:10
**up** [2] - 3:11, 3:17
**update** [1] - 4:15
**updates** [3] - 4:14, 5:19, 5:20
**USA** [1] - 2:19

## V

**VALSARTAN** [1] - 1:4
**Victoria** [1] - 4:11
**VICTORIA** [1] - 2:14

## W

**Wacker** [1] - 2:17
**wants** [1] - 4:24
**Washington** [1] - 2:10
**welcome** [1] - 3:3
**West** [1] - 2:17
**WHITELEY** [2] - 1:19, 1:20
**wish** [1] - 4:12

## Y

**York** [1] - 2:10
**Yvonne** [1] - 5:10

## Z

**Zhejiang** [1] - 2:11